Emerging Perspectives in Leadership Ethics

By Craig E. Johnson

A leader is a person who has an unusual degree of power to project onto other people his or her shadow, or his or her light. A leader is a person who has an unusual degree of power to create the conditions under which other people must live and move and have their being, conditions that can either be as illuminating as heaven or as shadowy as hell.

-- Parker Palmer

Philosopher Joanne Ciulla refers to ethics as the "heart" of leadership but reports that little of substance has been written about the relationship between ethical decision making and leadership behavior. In particular, leadership scholars tend to ignore or reject existing ethical theories. Ciulla doesn't clearly specify which existing ethical systems would prove most useful to leadership ethicists. However, any of the perspectives that appear in the typical ethics text-utilitarianism, Immanuel Kant's categorical imperative, virtue ethics, the Judeo-Christian ethic, John Rawls's social justice theory - can be applied to the leader-follower relationship. This article examines two additional ethical approaches, Taoism and communitarianism, which can also guide leadership scholars and practitioners. I survey the major components of both perspectives and apply them to a few of the moral issues faced by leaders. I conclude by identifying common elements in what appear to be very different ethical systems.
Taoist Leadership Ethics

Overview

Taoism began as one of the "100 Schools of Thought" of philosophy that emerged during the Warring States period (600-300 B.C.) in China. As the Chou dynasty disintegrated, the empire divided into a series of competing city-states. Citizens suffered from the ravages of war, poverty, and disease. Each school offered advice, primarily to rulers, for restoring peace and order to society.

Taoism's two major texts are the *Tao te Ching* and the *Chuang tzu*. The *Tao* (*The Classic of the Way and its Power and Virtue*) is better known and has been translated more often than any other book except the Bible. According to popular tradition, royal librarian Lao-tzu authored the *Tao* as he departed China in self-imposed exile. However, most commentators conclude that the text is a collection of the teachings of several sages. The *Chuang tzu* is also named after its purported author but, like the *Tao*, is considered to be the product of several teachers.

The writers of the *Tao te Ching* and the *Chuang tzu* use a variety of techniques to communicate insights about the Tao, including metaphor, analogy, narrative, humor, satire and commentary. Western readers are likely to be struck by the mystical, paradoxical nature of the texts. The Tao or Way is mysterious and beyond verbal description: "The Tao that can be told is not the eternal Tao./The name that can be named is not the eternal name." True knowledge comes, not from reason or language, but through direct experience with reality. Words can point us to the underlying nature of things but can never capture the richness of experience. As tools, they should be discarded when they have served their purpose:

The fish trap exists because of the fish; once you've gotten the fish, you can forget the trap. The rabbit snare exists because of the rabbit; once you've gotten the rabbit, you can forget the snare. Words exist because of meaning; once you've gotten the meaning, you can forget the words.

Paradox, the combination of seeming opposites, is one way to encourage readers to look for the deeper reality beyond words and to shatter traditional thought patterns. Both works are filled with such paradoxical statements as: "Always be without desire in order to observe its wondrous subtleties./Always have desire so that you may observe its manifestations." "The sage can achieve greatness, because he does not act great./Therefore, he can achieve greatness." "Discard goodness and goodness will come of itself."

By 200 A.D., Taoism had been divided into philosophical and religious branches.

Religious Taoists (drawing on passages from the *Chuang tzu* that describe the sage as someone who enjoys a long, happy life) sought to increase longevity and pleasure through exercise, diet and elixirs. They developed an elaborate cosmology along with a priesthood, temples and rituals. Religious Taoism and Buddhism intermingled. Taoism adopted such ideas as heaven, hells and judgment from the Buddhists who, in turn, drew from Taoism's emphasis on spontaneity, reflection and nature to
develop Ch'an (Zen) Buddhism. Many Taoist temples destroyed under Chinese communist rule have been rebuilt following economic liberalization.15

While a number of Americans follow Taoist religious practices, leadership scholars generally draw from Taoism’s philosophical roots. Taoist leadership principles are described in *The Tao of Leadership*,16 *The Tao of Management*,17 *The Tao of Personal Leadership*,18 *The Tao at Work*,19 and *Real Power: Business Lessons from the Tao Te Ching*.20

Taoist ethics are rooted in an understanding of the Way or Tao. The Tao is the nameless, shapeless force or Non-Being which brings all things into existence or Being and then nurtures them.21 Once the Tao takes form, it manifests itself through natural principles. One such principle is the notion of complementary opposites (the yin and the yang).22 There is no mountain without the valley, no light without darkness, no prosperity without calamity, no life without death. The universe operates as it should when these forces are in equilibrium. A second principle is circular movement or reversion, which means that plants, animals, rocks and other forms of matter ultimately return to their natural state. Flowers spring from the ground only to die to return to earth; animals are born, live and then die; mountains rise up only to be worn down by erosion. The third principle is positive inaction or wu-wei. Wu-wei is letting events take their own course, of complying with the forces of nature.23 Practitioners of the martial arts model the principle of wu-wei. They don't attack but deflect the force of their opponents' blows back to them and wear them out by yielding.24 Chuang tzu illustrates the power of working with the Tao by telling the story of an elderly man who fell into a great waterfall. By the time rescuers reached him, he had already climbed back up onto the bank. When asked how he survived his ordeal, the gentleman replied: "I go down with the swirls and come up with the eddies, following along the way the water goes and never thinking about myself. That's how I can stay afloat."25

The principles revealed in creation become the standards for ethical behavior. Ethical leaders and followers develop te or character by acting in harmony with the Tao, not by following commandments. Listing simplicity, patience and compassion as life’s greatest treasures is the closest the Taoist masters come to outlining a moral code.26 Instead of encouraging the right behavior, they believe that laws reflect a distrust of human nature and create a new class of citizens - lawbreakers. Efforts to reduce crime seem to increase it instead:27

Throw away holiness and wisdom, and people will be a hundred times happier. Throw away morality and justice, and people will do the right thing. Throw away industry and profit, and there won't be any thieves.28

Government reflects a distrust of the working of the Tao and human nature.29 When left alone, followers obey natural laws and society as a whole benefits. Therefore,
she/he governs best who governs least. Leaders attempting to solve problems often create new ones because they don't recognize the interrelationship of objects and events. For example, city officials who want to attract new industry to solve economic problems often fail to anticipate the complications - pollution, higher demand for city services, crowding, increased traffic congestion - that prosperity brings.

The ideal Taoist leader maintains a low profile, leading mostly by example and allowing followers to take ownership:

When the Master governs, the people are hardly aware that he [she] exists. Next best is a leader who is loved. Next, one who is feared. The worst is one who is despised.

If you don't trust the people, you make them untrustworthy. The Master doesn't talk, he [she] acts. when his [her] work is done, the people say, "Amazing: we did it, all by ourselves!"

Some of the most pointed comments of Lao tzu and Chuang tzu highlight the excesses of the feudal lords of their day. Both authors criticize the use of violence. Chuang tzu, for example, describes a reckless king who is so careless about killing his own citizens that their corpses spread like "grasses and weeds, turning his kingdom into marshland." Lao tzu treats force as an evil to be used only as a last resort:

Weapons are the tools of violence; all decent men [and women] detest them.

Weapons are the tools of fear; a decent man [woman] will avoid them except in the direst necessity and, if compelled, will use them only with the utmost restraint.

In addition to condemning violence, Lao tzu and Chuang tzu criticize corrupt rulers who live in splendor while their people suffer. These leaders oppress the people through threats and heavy taxation. As their subjects sink into poverty and starvation, they dress elegantly, hoard their treasure and gorge themselves on food and drink.

Taoists use the image of the uncarved block both
Taoists introduce an alternative model of leadership based on a series of images or metaphors drawn from nature and everyday life. Some of the more important metaphors include the uncarved block, water, the valley, and the clay pot.

The Uncarved Block
Taoists use the image of the uncarved block both as a reflection of the nature of the Tao and as a model of leadership. An uncarved block of wood or stone is nameless and shapeless like the Tao itself. Leaders should also be block-like, avoiding such entanglements as wealth, status, cleverness and glory while not intruding in the lives of followers. They ought calmly to accept whatever life brings - victory or defeat, joy or tragedy.

Though the uncarved block is small,
It cannot be employed [used as vessel] by anyone.
If kings and barons can keep [this unspoiled nature],
The whole world shall yield them lordship of their own accord.35

Taoists also use the image of the child to encourage leaders to live simply and humbly: "Who is rich in character is like a child."36 According to Hopfe: "The early Taoists looked upon the innocence of the child as an idea toward which all human beings should strive. The infant knows no craft and has no ambitions but to live; yet the child is cared for, fed, and clothed."37

Water
Water provides insight into how leaders should influence others by demonstrating that there is strength in weakness. Over time water cuts through the hardest rock, forming valleys and canyons:

There is nothing softer and weaker than water,
And yet there is nothing better for attacking hard and strong things.
For this reason there is no substitute for it.
All the world knows that the weak overcomes the strong and the soft overcomes the hard.38

Flexibility or pliability is one reason weakness is so powerful. Young blades of grass and saplings are more likely to survive windstorms because they bend rather than resist as mature trees do. For humans and other animals, flexibility is a sign of life, while stiffness signals death.

Leaders need to recognize the dynamic nature of reality and the circular nature of change and flex or bend to meet the demands of each situation that arises:

When a man is born, he is tender and weak.
At death, he is stiff and hard.
All things, the grass as well as trees, are tender and supple while alive. 
When dead, they are withered and dried.

Therefore the stiff and the hard are companions of death. 
The tender and the weak are companions of life. 
Therefore if the army is strong, it will not win. 
If a tree is stiff, it will break. 
The strong and the great are inferior, while the tender 
and the weak are superior.39

The Valley
While acknowledging the importance of both the yin and the yang, Taoists highlight 
the importance of the feminine force both in nature and in leadership. They 
encourage leaders to be valleys rather than prominent peaks. "He who is familiar 
with honor and glory but keeps to obscurity becomes the valley of the world," 
according to the Tao. "Being the valley of the world, he [she] has an eternal power 
which always suffices."40

The Clay Pot
Taoists celebrate emptiness by elevating nothing to higher status than something. 
This emphasis reflects their belief that the Tao or Non-Being brought all things into 
existence. A common household object - the clay pot - demonstrates the importance 
of nothingness. The most useful part of a pot is the emptiness within. In the same 
manner, the most useful part of a room is the empty space between the walls.41

Leaders and followers need to empty themselves by clearing away distractions or 
barriers that keep them from true knowledge of the Tao. One barrier is language. As 
noted earlier, words are inadequate to describe the true nature of the Tao. Naming is 
dangerous because giving labels to objects divides nature (which needs to be seen in 
its totality) into categories and fosters the mistaken belief that humans can somehow 
control it. While Taoists are suspicious of all language, they are especially critical of 
glib speech and empty words.42 Taoism privileges silence, encouraging contemplative 
thought in the belief that the natural unfolding of the universe is best understood 
directly through intuition.43 In sum: "Those who know do not talk./Those who talk do 
not know."44

Taoists also urge readers to put aside pseudo-intellectualism, technology and self-
will. Superficial intellectualism substitutes for true knowledge and technology can 
separate humans from the natural world. Ambition, pride, and the desire to assert 
control over others are barriers to true contentment. Leaders, as they strive to be 
uncarved blocks and children, must leave selfishness behind: "Do not be an 
embodier of fame; do not be a storehouse of schemes; do not be an undertaker of 
projects; do not be a proprietor of wisdom....Be empty, that is all."45

Application
Throughout Chinese history, individuals have often been both Confucian and Taoist, 
following Confucian thought in public life and Taoism in their private affairs.46 
Contemporary western writers also suggest that leaders can adopt Taoist principles 
on a piecemeal basis.47 Nevertheless, Taoist ethics cannot be divorced from the
philosophy's underlying world view. Leaders may decide to adopt only certain Taoist practices. However, they should first acknowledge that Taoism is a complex, comprehensive integrated system of beliefs, not a set of unrelated concepts. With this caveat in mind, I will apply Taoist thought to some of the ethical issues faced by leaders.

Taoism seems to speak most directly to the leader's use of power and position. Specifically, the Taoist leader:

- exerts minimal influence in the lives of followers
- encourages followers to take ownership of tasks
- employs "soft tactics" (persuasion, empowerment, modeling, teamwork, collaboration, service)
- rejects the use of violence
- demonstrates creativity and flexibility
- promotes harmony with nature and others
- lives simply and humbly
- rejects the trappings of status and promotes equality
- recognizes the underlying spiritual dimension of reality

These principles appear to provide an ethical framework for many of the latest trends in the leadership literature: empowerment, teamwork, collaboration, servant leadership, spirituality in the workplace, and rapid innovation. In addition, they can be applied to ethical issues raised by the concentration of power and wealth. It is hard to imagine a Taoist approving of the vast gap in compensation between CEOs and employees in the United States, for example, or giving his/her blessing to such perks as a company jet, private dining room, and executive stock options.

Environmental leaders have drawn upon Taoism's emphasis on working in harmony with nature and the interconnectedness of life to develop an ecological ethic. The natural world appears to renew itself when left alone and when all elements of the ecosystem participate. Trying to manage nature can have disastrous consequences. Suppressing forest fires has led, over the long term, to uncontrollable blazes as forests age and tinder builds up. Native fish populations increase, not through the supplemental stocking of hatchery fish, but when streams are returned to their natural states. Environmentalist Gary Snyder notes that definitions of the term "wild" have much in common with how Chinese define the Tao - self-organizing, playful, independent, and surprising. According to Snyder:

Wilderness is a place where the wild potential is fully expressed, a Diversity of living and nonliving beings flourishing according to their own sorts of order. In ecology we speak of "wild systems." When an ecosystem is fully functioning, all the members are present at the assembly. To speak of wilderness is to speak of wholeness.

Not all the applications of Taoist thought are as clear as those described above. In fact, leaders are likely to be frustrated in their attempts to use Taoist principles to resolve many ethical dilemmas. Leaders often face ethical questions related to honesty and the control of information, for example. According to the Taoists, the
leader must answer these questions based on intuition, not on a formal code of ethics. Consider the case of a middle-level manager wrestling with whether to conceal or reveal his company's decision to shut down. Executives have asked him to keep the information to himself until they make a public announcement. In the meantime, employees may make financial commitments without knowing that they will soon lose their jobs. What does it mean to act in harmony with the Tao in this situation? Compassion and the desire for equality would seem to require disclosure but releasing information may keep events from running their natural course. Further, the fact that the universe is in a constant cycle of reversion means that what is right in one context may be wrong in another. Even judging the consequences of ethical choices is difficult because actors don't know how events will unfold. What may appear as a negative consequence at first (a job loss) may later turn out for the best (a better job at another firm). The following story, taken from the Huai Nan Tzu, makes this point:

A poor farmer's horse ran off into the country of the barbarians. All his neighbors offered their condolences, but his father said, "How do you know that this isn't good fortune?" After a few months the horse returned with a barbarian horse of excellent stock. All his neighbors offered their congratulations, but his father said, "How do you know that this isn't a disaster?" The two horses bred, and the family became rich in fine horses. The farmer's son spent much of his time riding them; one day he fell off and broke his hipbone. All his neighbors offered the farmer their condolences, but his father said, "How do you know that this isn't good fortune?" Another year passed, and the barbarians invaded the frontier. All the able-bodied young men were conscripted, and nine-tenths of them died in the war. Thus good fortune can be disaster and vice versa. Who can tell how events will be transformed?50

**Communitarianism**

**Overview**

The modern Communitarian movement began in 1990 when fifteen ethicists, social scientists and philosophers, led by sociologist Amatai Etzioni, met in Washington, D. C., to express their concerns about society. They took the name "Communitarian" to highlight their interest in shifting society's focus from individual rights to community responsibilities.51 The next year the group started a journal and organized a teach-in that produced the Communitarian platform. In 1993 Etzioni explained the Communitarian agenda in a book entitled *The Spirit of Community: The Reinvention of American Society*. Etzioni suggests: 1) a moratorium on the creation of more individual rights; 2) recognition of the link between citizenship rights and civic responsibilities; 3) acceptance of the fact that some duties may not bring appreciable benefits; and 4) reinterpretation of some legal rights to improve public safety and health.

There is a strong sense of urgency in the Communitarian message. Proponents believe that United States culture is fragmenting and in a state of moral decline. Evidence of decay can be found in the growing power of special interest groups, the polarization of political discourse, and high divorce and crime rates.52 Renewal will be sparked by the creation of a series of local, regional, national, and international communities.
John Gardner provides one list of the elements that characterize responsive communities:

1. Wholeness Incorporating Diversity. The existence of community requires some vision of a common good or purpose. Yet, focus on wholeness should not obscure the fact that diverse groups within the system may have competing interests.

2. A Reasonable Set of Shared Values. Communities share values in addition to a common purpose. Important values include equality, justice, freedom and the dignity of the individual.

3. Caring, Trust and Teamwork. Healthy communities respect individual differences and foster cooperation and connection. Members feel both a sense of belonging and responsibility. Fostering this atmosphere requires recognizing the rights of minorities, effective conflict resolution, and working together on shared tasks.

4. Effective Internal Communication. Members of responsive communities engage in frequent face-to-face communication. They freely share information and listen to others.

5. Participation. A diverse, complex society requires a network of leaders functioning throughout society. This means that a large number of individuals must carry out leadership tasks and collaborate with leaders from other segments of society.

6. Affirmation. The maintenance of community requires continual reaffirmation where members celebrate their history, values and identity.

7. Links beyond community. To prevent isolation, a community must maintain healthy connections with other, often larger, communities. A neighborhood association must remain in contact with other neighborhood groups and city officials, for instance.

8. Development of Young People. Schools and other community groups prepare children for the roles as citizens (including positions as leaders). These institutions communicate shared values and purposes and remind young people of the group’s heritage.

9. A Forward View. Healthy communities have a sense of where they are headed. Anticipating changes focuses the attention of group members and prevents the community from drifting into decay.

10. Institutional Arrangements for Community Maintenance. Government, in particular, must nurture collaboration between diverse groups in the community. Students must also learn how to maintain the life of the community.

Creation of the kinds of communities envisioned by Gardner and others requires citizens to shoulder a number of collective responsibilities. Communitarian citizens must stay informed about public issues and become active in community affairs.

They must serve on juries, work with others on common projects, care for the less fortunate, clean up corruption, provide guidance to children, and so on.54 These tasks are often accomplished through a network of voluntary associations such as churches, environmental groups, neighborhood associations, and service organizations.55

The rise of Communitarianism coincides with renewed interest in virtue ethics. Both are concerned with the development of moral character. Virtue ethicists highlight the role of the person or actor in ethical decision-making, arguing that individuals with high moral character are more likely to make wise ethical choices. Virtues are "deep-rooted dispositions, habits, skills, or traits of character that incline persons to perceive, feel and act in ethically right and sensitive ways."56 Common virtues include courage, moderation, justice, love, compassion, strength, hospitality, and integrity.57 The Communitarian movement fosters the development of these qualities. A "virtue cycle" is created. Virtuous citizens build strong, moral communities that, in turn, encourage further character formation.

Application
In their Communitarian manifesto, Etzioni and his colleagues demonstrate Communitarian principles by applying them to specific issues. For example, they support campaign finance reform, sobriety checkpoints and gun control. They advocate combating hate speech through nonlegal means and, when it comes to the AIDS epidemic, put the group’s right to know ahead of victims’ right to privacy. On these issues we have a clear indication of how the ethical leader should act. However, communities frequently have conflicting moral standards. What does a leader do in these cases? Communitarians advocate acting at the local level whenever possible,58 but what if local values are oppressive? For example, until the 1960s, segregation was the norm throughout the southern United States. Change came, in many ways, through the intervention of the federal government, the Civil Rights Movement and other larger communities.

A contemporary clash of communities can be found in the political divisions caused by Oregon’s "Death With Dignity" Act that sanctions physician-assisted suicide. Twice voters have approved this measure despite strong opposition from medical and religious groups. Now Congress has proposed legislation to outlaw the use of painkillers for medically assisted suicide.59 Members of Oregon's congressional delegation must choose between the needs of the state and the will of the federal legislature acting on behalf of the nation as a whole. Oregon House members from both parties oppose the bill and Senator Ron Wyden has vowed to filibuster against it. Republican Senator Gordon Smith, however, has not yet decided what he will do if the bill is passed in the House and comes before the Senate.60

Communitarians are divided over how much latitude to grant local communities in cases such as this one. Some argue that local groups should determine their values without outside interference. Others try to strike a balance between community

norms and deonological claims, arguing that local communities be allowed to make their own decisions as long as they do not violate overarching moral values or duties. Yet, opting for the deonological approach is of limited use in the assisted suicide debate because both sides can claim moral high ground. Proponents of the "Death With Dignity" Act believe that suicide is justified by such values as compassion, quality of life, free will, and self-determination. Opponents give more priority to the sanctity of life and argue that extending life is more compassionate than prematurely ending it.

Concern for the common good may be the most useful ethical principle to come out the Communitarian movement. Considering the needs of the broader community discourages selfish, unethical behavior. Lying, polluting or manufacturing dangerous products may serve the needs of a leader or organization, but such actions are unethical because they rarely benefit society as a whole. In addition to discouraging immoral actions, a desire to further the common good can bring about a substantial shift in how leaders and groups interact with outsiders. The practice of public relations is a case in point. Organizations typically use public relations strategies to persuade outside audiences to support their programs and to buy their products. Communication flows from the organization to the public and managers rarely modify their objectives in response to community concerns. In contrast to the traditional model, a Communitarian approach to public relations encourages professionals to view themselves as community builders. In this role, public relations practitioners share information with outsiders, engage in dialogue with organizational publics, build long term relationships with constituencies, listen and then change their goals if necessary, and collaborate to resolve disputes and solve problems.

By promoting the common good, Communitarianism encourages dialogue and discussion within and among groups. Fowler, for example, argues that true communities are characterized by "people deciding together, face to face, conversing with and respecting each other in a setting which is as equal as possible." Hollenbach calls for "intellectual solidarity" which fosters conversation and debate about how to define the common good, what the good life means, and how communities ought to relate to one another. Consensus about ethical choices may come out of these discussions. One of the primary ethical duties of the Communitarian leader is creating a framework (characterized by equality, openness and honesty) that encourages discussion of moral questions.

**Conclusions**

At first glance, Taoism and Communitarianism seem to be a study in contrasts: old vs. new, East vs. West, passivity vs. action. Despite their obvious differences, these two systems have elements in common. One similarity can be found in the evangelical fervor of their adherents. Western writers claim that Taoism is the path to both professional and personal fulfillment. They suggest that Taoist leaders experience a sense of inner peace or balance often missing in corporate America:

The more you embody these [Taoist] teachings, the more the scattered parts of your life fall into place and become a seamless whole; work seems effortless; your heart opens by itself to all the people in your life; you have time for everything worthwhile; your mind becomes empty, transparent, serene; you embrace sorrow as

much as joy, failure as much as success; you unthinkingly act with integrity and compassion; and you find that you have come to trust life completely.68

Communitarians are also out to make converts and make no attempt to hide this fact. In his description of the Communitarian agenda, Etzioni urges readers to join him in the Communitarian movement to promote moral revival.69 Descriptions of societal decay and calls for renewal are a popular motif in Communitarian literature.70

Taoism and Communitarianism also share a concern for virtue. The Taoists assert that the ideal leader is marked by te or character, which is based on conforming to the workings of the Tao. Their focus is on being, not doing. The Communitarians also emphasize virtue, hoping to build strong moral communities that promote virtuous behavior. However, they believe that virtues are manifested and maintained through action (civic involvement, celebrating community, promoting values, etc).

Both approaches are marked by a degree of ambiguity, offering clear ethical guidance on some issues while leaving many other dilemmas unresolved. Taoism rejects standardized ethical codes and argues instead for moral relativism. Communitarians acknowledge that a number of ethical issues must be discussed and debated in order to form an ethical consensus. We can expect followers of the Tao to make different choices on a variety of ethical issues. Communitarians also will come to different conclusions when faced with the same ethical questions.

Finally, Taoism and Communitarianism seem particularly well-suited to the study and practice of leadership ethics. The original Taoists hoped to sway the leaders of their day; Communitarians acknowledge that the health of society rests upon the actions of leaders from all segments of society who must find ways to cooperate to serve the common good. Leadership scholars, practitioners, and ethicists alike should draw upon these two systems when examining the moral questions associated with leadership.

Notes

2. Portions of the first section of this paper were presented at the 1998 National Communication Association convention, Chicago, IL.


Ames (San Francisco: Chinese Materials Center, 1977). [return to text]

22. M. Garrett, 1993. [return to text]

23. C. Ku-ying, 1977 [return to text]


34. Ibid., pp. 9, 53, 74, 75. [return to text]


36. Ibid., p. 252. [return to text]


39. Ibid., p. 233. [return to text]


